

*ERUVIN IN URBAN AND METROPOLITAN AREAS,
LECTURED BY RABBI YISROEL BELSKY
OF YESHIVA TORAH VODAATH*

SEE THE LIGHT AND TRUTH!

**A PROJECT
PRODUCED BY THE STUDENTS OF
YESHIVA TORAH VODAATH
April 2000**

1. I generally try... try to avoid these things during the *shiur*, but there has... there has... there has been a certain amount of confusion created by people, and *rabosei*, I am telling you, very, very extremely malicious people, people who have no honest intention whatsoever, to confuse the... to con... to confuse the *tzibur* by mentioning a bunch of names and creating out of an *aveirah* a *mitzvah*, saying, that the *Baal Shem Tov* went around making *eruvim*, and therefore it's a *mitzvah* to make *eruvim*, in *Shulchan Aruch* it says it's a *mitzvah*, in *Gemara* says it's a *mitzvah* to make *eruvim*, and there is a whole long list of people who said, the *eruv* in Brooklyn is *kusher veyosher*, and a bunch of names are mentioned, Rav Henkin, the Satmar Rebbe, Reb Shlomo Duvid Kahana from Varsha, etc., etc., etc., and therefore they're going *befkudas ha-Rabbonim* and they started to make the *eruv*.

2. I want to take the matter step by step. First of all, the sign with all the information is outrageous lies, it's *sheker* from, *muchlat* [complete] from beginning to end. Rav Henkin specifically wrote, *keseder* [constantly] published, that it's *osur* to make an *eruv* in Brooklyn. In fact, I tried to get hold of the old *Hapardes* [name of a monthly journal] from... from the 40's, where they had this debate going on for many months, whether they should make an *eruv* in Manhattan, and there was... The reason Manhattan was very special because there... the reason why...

[Short interrupted discussion]

3. ... *Iz azoi*. So one of the points brought up, was whether they should... In Manhattan there was a sea wall built around Manhattan. If you're familiar with that, in the East Side, all through Manhattan, they made the ships should be able to come straight up into Manhattan, so in the late 18 hundreds, in the early 19 hundreds they built what they call a sea wall. In other words, they made that there shouldn't be any... any beaches, any slopes from the other Manhattan island like the natural slope, and cut, dredged the river to the point that the bank of the island is vertical, it goes straight, so that boats can come straight up into Manhattan, and they made fences around *ruva deruva* [most] of Manhattan.

4. Because of that, there was a *Rov* in the early 19 hundreds, Rav Seigel, who was the Sherftza *Rov*, he... he made an *eruv* in Manhattan. At that time he boast a tremendous storm, some were against it and for it. Eventually, Rav Seigel left New York and he settled in some other place. But this went on for many years, and finally in the 40's they wanted to build an *eruv* in Manhattan again, in the late 40's. So Rav Henkin was one of those who were for Manhattan, for building an *eruv* there. Reb Moshe was against it. Reb Moshe said, he understood the... these... the... the *daas* of the *matirim*, they should not be *mocha* [protesting]. That was were Reb Moshe wrote this letter.

5. In Brooklyn, it was *hakol modim* that it was *osur* to make an *eruv*. There is no sea wall. All Brooklyn's edges when it hits the ocean, on all sides it's all beaches, there is no... there is no wall into the... into the sea at all, and there are streets and highways and everything that are *mefulosh meshaar leshaar* [continuous from gate to gate that are open, without any interference]. The Manhattan Bridge goes straight into Flatbush Avenue, and Flatbush Avenue goes continued straight all the way out until the Marine Parkway Bridge. Uhm... It does, it doesn't... the... it... it doesn't, then... and so on and so forth.

[Short interrupted discussion]

6. ... The... So... *Adaraba*, in all the articles in the *Hapardes*, Rav Henkin and the... the others were *mefalpel* [discussing], whether you could be *gozer* Manhattan *atu* [because of] Brooklyn. In other words, they shouldn't make an *eruv* in Manhattan because they might come to make one in Brooklyn. And *hakol modim*, that they... that it's *osur* to make one in Brooklyn. Rav Henkin said, "it's not a problem, we find in *Shas* that they made an *eruv* in part of the city, so people carried in part of the city, and the other part of the city they couldn't carry, *un af al pi kain* [and nevertheless] they made an *eruv*, so it shows that you can't be *gozer*".

7. The others held that you could. They pointed the experience, there were hundreds and hundreds of people who carried in Williamsburg when they moved from the East Side, because in the early... in the 30's, and even in the 40's, because they have carried, because of the Sherftza *Rov's* *eruv*, so they carried in... in Williamsburg as well. But Rav Henkin held, that from *Shas* and *poskim* you can't be *gozer*. But one after another, they *aserd* it in Brooklyn.

8. The... the one who wanted to... who wanted to build the *eruv* in... in Manhattan was... what's his name... from... from the *Torah Shleima* [name of a monthly journal], it slipped my mind. I'll come back, it just slipped my mind for a second. Reb Mendel Kasher who wrote the *Torah Shleima*. So he was a *Rov*, he wanted to make an *eruv* in Manhattan and when the Debreciner *Rov* came here, he had the... he had a knack... he has... he got the knack always for, you know, that research, cause he... he edited the *Sdai Chemed*, and worked on it for many years, and found *mareh mekomos* [references] for everything, and published it in... Rabbi Kasher who... The *Torah Shleima* was a lot of research in *Chumash* and *Chazal*. He wanted to hire him on the staff of the *eruv*. Well then he... he still had *mamesh* nothing to eat in the house, because he was working for, you know, a few hours a week, next to nothing, so he wanted to give him a lucrative job, to help in the construction of an *eruv* in Manhattan.

9. The Debreciner *Rov* went to the Satmar Rebbe and asked him if he should do it. This is what the Debreciner *Rov* told us, and he wrote it into... he wrote it down in a letter. So he asked the Satmar *Rov*, he says, it's a *shtikel pekuach nefesh*, because he has *mamesh* nothing to eat, and if he could take a job helping to build an *eruv* in Manhattan. The Satmar *Rov* told him that, "*ich halt az se da nesoyon fun heintuga dor* [I hold that it's the divine test of today's generation] to make *eruvim*, and *Chas Vesholom*, it's... it's like "*Yehoreg V'al Yavor*" [one must forfeit his life rather than violate]. Never, never should have anything to do with an *eruv* in Manhattan and Brooklyn.

10. And Reb Mechael Ber Weismandel had an idea to build an *eruv* in part of Williamsburg, where the streets were crooked, and he felt that it could be... What's close to the river, it's close to the Navy Yard. Reb Mechael - this is what we were told by... by the people involved - Reb Mechael went to the Satmar *Rov* and asked him. Satmar *Rov* said he shouldn't do it, and he argued with him a little bit, and after a few minutes, he said; "*Reb Mechael Ber*", he said, "*luzt op*" [let go], he says, "*ir vet nisht boien ken* [you will not build an] *eruv*", he says, "*azoi lang vi ich leb vet nisht zein ken* [as long I'm alive there will be no] *eruv in Brooklyn*", that's it what he said. He told him those words, we have it written down.

11. Reb Aron Zecher *Levracha*, when it came to Manhattan, Reb Aron convened a meeting of

all *Rabbonim*, because there were those who said they should make in Manhattan, there were those who said they shouldn't. So Reb Aron convened a meeting of all the *Rabbonim*, and he asked that they should *asur* an *eruv* in Manhattan and in the whole entire New York. So all the *Rabbonim* agreed, and they signed a *Kol Kora*, everyone of them, including Rav Henkin, including everyone, and they *aserd* making an *eruv* forever in Manhattan and in Brooklyn. Public *eruv* - I'm not talking about closed *eruv* in dead end streets and that kind - a regular street.

[Short interrupted discussion]

12. ...Let me just give you a little of history. Reb Shlomo Duvid Kahana was a *Rov* in Varsha. And Varsha, it was... it was the only large city in Europe that had an *eruv*. Paris, London and none of the large cities had an *eruv*. The only large city that had an *eruv* was Varsha. Varsha had the *eruv* in 1880 when there was 200,000 people living in Varsha.

13. In 1922 when Poland declared independence, and all... from all over Poland they flocked to Varsha, created a new capital, a new... a new country called Poland. Don't forget that Poland was... didn't exist since 1795. It was partitioned like... like Kurdistan, that's what... what was Poland. And then, they put together this country, and they... Varsha became the capital. And thousands and thousands of *Pollaken* [Poles] flocked to Varsha. So they had... the city was on two sides. The river, the Vistula river runs straight through Varsha. Still about a 400,000 people on each side of the river, and together there were more than *Sishim Ribo* [600,000 people].

14. And in the middle of the winter the river froze solid, and people would walk across it like in a street, and people said that the *eruv*... that the *eruv* should be taken off. Reb Shlomo Duvid Kahana wrote *Teshuvos*, saying that the *eruv* is still valid, and it should... there's no talk of taking down. The river is still *mechalek* [dividing] the city, it's really two cities, it's not one city, and so on.

15. Reb Shlomo Duvid Kahana was one of the biggest *Rabbonim* in Europe. He was the one who organized the *beis din* who were *rau* [suitable] to *pasken* on all the *Agunos*, and they relied on his word for everything. He was the *de facto* *Rov* of Varsha. When there was no *Rov* in Varsha, he was the president of the "Vaad Harabbonim [Rabbinical Board] of Varsha". All of his *Teshuvos* show, that they can't make an *eruv* in a city which has *Shishim Ribo* in the total population of the city if it's connected, unless there's a river running in between, where there's less than *Shishim Ribo* on either side.

16. That whole list of names there, is *shikrei shkorim* [lies after lies]. You understand? You have people... There... there was a *Meshugana* [madman] who set up an *eruv* in Williamsburg, and when the Satmar *Rov* was in his 90's and he was sat frozen all day long and people came by and he just waved his finger, and so... and... hardly... hardly moved, so at the end he gave out money, because his *sechel* was still there, and he was... he sat and he gave out people who came... *aniam* [poor people] came, and he gave out money for *tzedaka*, and this *Yid* came by and asked for money, and he got \$300.00, and he went out this *Meshugana*, *Rasha Merusha* [crazy, extremely wicked man], and he went out, and told everybody that the Satmar *Rov* was *maskim* to his *eruv*, and... so therefore he... so the Satmar *Rov* had *charata* [regret], and was *maskim* to an *eruv*, you understand? You're... you're... you're... you're... you're... you're dealing...

17. I... I have here a letter from Avrum... Avrum Leitner, who was the closest... the closest one to the Satmar Rebbe. He just wrote it.

"הנני להודיע לכל מאן דבעי למידע, כי הייתי כמה פעמים במעשה שהציעו רבנים לעשות עירוב בברוקלין, וכבוד קדושת אדמו"ר זכרוננו לברכה, בעל ויואל משה, לא הסכים בשום אופן ואמר שאין לעשות עירוב בברוקלין ??? איני זו מדבריו הקדושים, ומה שעשו עירוב ברחוב "בלאק" שאני דר בו שלא בידיעתו וכל שכן שלא הסכימו, ואני מזהיר לכל הסרים למשמעתי שלא לסמוך על העירוב..."

18. So they had a meeting 20 years ago. They had a meeting 20, 21 years ago. So Rav Bick *zt"l* called a meeting in Borough Park, and all the *Rabbonim* from Borough Park came there, including the Debreciner, and every, every *Rov* in Borough Park, from the *Chasidisha* from... from the *Litvisha*, whoever was there. And one fact is, one person who is still around, who was by the meeting. He was one of the younger *Rabbonim*, now he is one of the oldest. That's Yankel Pollack from the *Shomrei... Shomrei Emunah Shul*. Rav Singer, they were all there. And they all voted unanimously not to have an *eruv beshim ponim* [in no way], of *cheshash* [because of a doubt] of *Chilul Shabbos*.

19. Reb Moshe then wrote a letter. I just... I had it on my desk. I'll find it, because it's hundreds of copies. I was there by Reb Moshe when he wrote the letter. Reb Moshe wrote the letter, that it's *osur Medeoraisah* [forbidden from the original Torah law] to make an *eruv* in Brooklyn, in Borough Park, in any *chelek* [part] of it, and whoever does it, is... is... is... is *over* [transgressing] on an *Issur Deoraisah* of *Chilul Shabbos*.

20. The *Rabbonim* all there discussed it, and in, walked Klein, the... the fellow who was behind the *eruv*. And Rav Bick told me the following conversation, and I couldn't believe it. And then a couple of days later, I received in the mail a *kunteres* [booklet] written from Klein, and in the *kunteres*, he writes word for word exactly what happened, and this is what happened. He... he came in saying, that he holds they should make an *eruv* in... in... in... in Borough Park, and he intends to make one. And they told him, "How could you go ahead and make it when the *Rabbonim* say not to?" So he said, "*Halacha Kedivrei Hamekil B'eruv*" [that the *halacha* follows the lenient ruling when dealing with *eruv*in]. It says in the *Gemara*, "*Halacha Kedivrei Hamekil B'eruv*". So... so they asked him... Rav Bick said to him like this; "Rav Klein" he said, "but the *Chazal* said "*Halacha Kedivrei Hamekil B'eruv*" they meant a different kind of *eruv* altogether".

21. By the way *rabosei*, in *Shas* the word "*eruv*" doesn't mean sticks and strings, it's called a "*Tzuras Hapesach*" [form of a doorway], it's never called "*eruv*". It's a *Yiddish* word "*eruv*". It would be... It would be spelled, "*Alef, Yud, Yud, Reish, Yud, Vuv, Vuv*". It would be much more appropriate. It's a *Yiddish* word. The word "*eruv*" means "*eruvei chatzeros*" and "*eruv tavshilin*" or an "*eruv techumin*", that's what "*eruv*" means.

22. So, he told him like this, he said, that; "there's... *Chazal aserd*, they made a *chumra* to carry from one *reshus hayachid* [private domain] to another *reshus hayachid*, and then they said, that what... in order to do that you have to make an *eruv*. That's what they meant "*Halacha Kedivrei Hamekil B'eruv*", but your *eruv* that you're talking about is a *kula* [lenient ruling] to be *matir* carrying in a *reshus harabim* [public domain], on that, they never said "*Halacha Kedivrei Hamekil*". So he got up and he

said, "nein, ich vel eich brengen a reia [no, I will bring you proof], that they meant my *eruv*. Cause in *din* it says, you're supposed to make a *bracha*, "Asher Kidshanu Bemitzvosov Vetzivanu Al Mitzvas Eruv". He said, "the way you're saying that it's a *chumra*, - *avada*, you can't make a *bracha* on a *chumra*, how can you make a *bracha* on a *chumra*? Who ever heard of making a *bracha* on a *chumra*? But the way I say, that it's a *tekana* [remedy], so people could carry their babies and walk out and enjoy the *Shabbos* and not sit miserable a whole day, so *avada* on that you make a *bracha*".

23. They sat there in a state of shock. They told me, they never saw such *am haratzis* [ignorance] in their entire life, and said... There... there isn't a single *boor* who is in a bungalow colony who has no education and whatsoever, who ever heard or contemplated that when you make the sticks and the strings on top you make a *bracha*, "Asher Kidshanu Bemitzvosov Vetzivanu Laasos... Al Mitzvas Eruv". And there isn't a single *Yidina* [Jewish woman], the biggest *Am Haratzia* [ignorant woman] in the world that doesn't know that you make a *bracha* on... on... on an *eruv chatzeros* and an *eruv tavshilin*. It's in the *Machzor*, it's in the *Sidur*, it's in the *Bencherel*, in the *Hagada*, it's all over the place, with pictures and everything, in *Yiddish* and... and everything. I mean, there... there isn't a single person that makes such a stupid mistake. They... they said, they have no... you know... the... the... the... the... it has no *reia*ch *Torah* [essence of *Torah*].

24. He also got up there and said, and this is what he told us in the beginning of this master work on *eruv* that; "Shlomo Hamelech built an *eruv* in Yerushalaim, and... and the *Rebono Shel Olom* was happy over it, cause it says, "Beshaa Shetiken Shlomo Eruvin Yotzo Bas Kol V'omar, Im Chacham B'ni Yismach Libi Gam Ani" ["at the time when Solomon enacted the laws of *eruv*, a heavenly voice emanated and said, "if my son is wise, my heart will be glad too"] - you understand?, - and I built an *eruv* in Brooklyn and everybody is against me, how could that be?" If the *Rebono Shel Olom* was happy when *Shlomo Hamelech* built an *eruv*..., you understand? That's what he wrote, "Beshaa Shetiken Shlomo Eruvin", - *Shlomo Hamelech* built an *eruv* in Yerushalaim. *Ir farshtet* [you understand]? The... the *boorishness* in such a... in such a statement is beyond belief. But... but it's published, it's all in the *kuntereisim* [booklets]. That was the basis behind that *eruv* from 20 years ago. The *Rabbonim* all *k'echod* [together] *aserd* it.

25. Last week they had a meeting of 25 *Rabbonim*, and all the *Rabbonim* in Borough Park came together, the *Chasidisha* and the *Litvisha*, everybody. And they voted unanimously not to have an *eruv*, against an *eruv*. And into the meeting walked the other perpetrator, the fellow named Katz and he... and he got in... he walked in, and he started screaming and joking, and he was *mevei'ish* [insulting] them. He started making fun of everything as if there was nobody there.

26. A couple of the *Rabbonim* who were there by that meeting told me, that the... the... the *Prustkeit* [vulgarity] from the fellow was beyond belief, as if there was nobody there. He just walked in and made fun like that, and... and... and screamed and carried on. And they told him, "you are not allowed to do... do such thing", so he said, "I hold, every *Rov* can make on his block, no other *Rov* in the whole... in the whole section could... could interfere with what one *Rov* makes on his own block". *Shoin* [okay]! And he walks out.

27. So they put out this *Kol Kora*:

"דעת תורה, מהרבנים הגאונים תושבי עירנו שליט"א, באסיפת הרבים שהתקיימה ביום ג' פרשת לך לך תש"ס לפרט קטן ונשארו ונתנו על דבר לעשות עירוב בשכונתנו בארא פארק והיות שכבר דנו בזה הרבנים הגאונים הצדיקים מדור שלפנינו זכרונם לברכה ויבדל לחיים טובים ארוכים אשר הם בחיים אתנו לאורך ימים טובים, והחליטו שאין לעשות עירוב כי יש בזה חששות חמורות של חילול שבת קודש חס ושלום ובודאי שאין לזוז מדבריהם, ובזכות שמירת שבת קודש כהלכתו נזכה לגאולה שלימה."

- signed, Avrohom Chaim Shpitzer, the Bobover Dayan, the... the... you have Rav Tirnauer, you have the Satmara Dayan, Boyaner, Skverer, Pupa, Matersdorfer Rov. Skulener Rebbe was there and he signed...

28. Question: Are there 25 signatures?

Rosh Yeshiva: Hershel Brody, you have the... you have Yankel Horowitz, the Telzer, and so on. You don't have 25 signatures here, you have 15 signatures on here.

"מפני אפס הפנאי בערב שבת קודש לא פרסמנו יותר חתימות ויפיעו בקרוב."

29. There were one or two who were afraid to sign. In fact, one of them got up and said, he doesn't want to sign, why? Because it's too harsh, it says, "Chashoshos Chamoros Shel Chilul Shabbos" ["serious doubts of desecrating the *Shabbos*"], so the Satmara Dayan on specific instructions from the Satmar Rebbe said, that if it doesn't say "Chashoshos Shel Chilul Shabbos", he won't sign.

30. Now, on... on what, did these people... what did these people, building an *eruv*... what is... what is the *pshat*, *mitzad* [of those sided] to build, *mitzad* not to build?

31. Question: But on 44th [48th] Street, they have gates...?

Rosh Yeshiva: Yeah... so... the gates *rabosei*... There's only one street in the entire Borough Park that has gates, that could be sort of has gates, which was the rationale for building the *eruv* on 48th Street between 15th and 16th by the Bobover. And the reason was like this: because they received permission from the city to set up gates. Even the Mayor was there, Mayor Koch, where there was a whole ceremony, and they renamed the street for "Bobov Promenade", and there was music and everything, and speeches, and they received permission to set up barriers so that the children could play. From morning until night they could set up barriers. It's the only street in the entire Borough Park that has such permission, and therefore they have the *eruv* on that block alone. So since they could...

32. Question: Yagdil Torah, the Gerer Yeshiva has permission to set up barriers...?

Rosh Yeshiva: This is not... it's not a private block. This block... this block is supposed to be... was supposed to be a private block. However, the... the Bobover Dayan who signed over here, who is the Bobover Rov's *eidum* [son-in-law], himself said, that the Bobover Rov said, only on the sidewalk, because there's a *tzad* [possibility to consider], maybe that's *Tzidei Reshus Harabim* [borders of a public domain], but not in the middle of the street. Even with the barriers, the street is open, because it's open on the sidewalk. It's a very *shvacha heter* [weakly based permissive dispensation], and he himself was very upset. But it was only because they were given a special... This street is different than all the other streets. They were *meyached* [designating] the street

as a promenade. They renamed it "Bobov Promenade", it's not a *chelek* [part] of the city.

33. As... as it is *rabosei*, the... let... lets... lets see what... what... what... what's... What are the *tzedodim* [possibilities to consider]... In fact, I don't want to go too much into it. Lets put... Lets take a look. As you know, all the *Reshonim* from the school of the *Rambam* and the *Ramban* and the others, they say that, if a street is sixteen *amos* wide, it's part of a regular city, *seratya u'pelatya* [a highway and marketplace], and it's *mefulosh* [open], it goes into the other streets, it goes into another *reshus harabim*, so that's a *reshus harabim*, and in a *reshus harabim Deoraisah* [public domain where carrying is forbidden from the original Torah law] you can't have a *Tzurat Hapesach*.

34. The question is: Is Brooklyn a *reshus harabim Deoraisah*? So, there are two things they point to. One of the things is, that it says in... in the *Mechaber* [original author of the *Shulchan Aruch*], in *Siman Reish Mem Daled* [chapter 244], so it says in the *Mechaber*, *Shin Mem Daled* [chapter 344], it says... it says in *Mechaber* like this, that a *reshus harabim Deoraisah*, is a street that is sixteen *amos* wide and it's *mefulosh* [open] to other *reshuyos* [domains]. But there is another *deia* [opinion] that says, that *Kol Sh'en Shishim Ribo Ovros Bo Bechol Yom* [unless there are 600,000 people who frequent it every day, it] is not a *reshus harabim*.

35. (Give me the... One second... Yeah, I have this, this old *Mishna Berurah* we have over here.) *Shin Mem Hai* [345]. The *Mechaber* brings like this.

"וַיֵּשׁ אֲדוּמִיִּם שָׂכֵל שְׂאִין שְׁשִׁים רַבּוֹא עוֹבְרִים בּוֹ בְּכָל יוֹם
אֵינוֹ רְשׁוֹת הָרַבִּים"

36. Now, so therefore they say like this: The *Mechaber* is a continuation from the prev[ious]... the beginning of the *seif* [paragraph]

"אֵיזֶהוּ רְשׁוֹת הָרַבִּים, רְחֻבוֹת וְשׁוּקִים הָרַחְבִּים ט"ז אַמָּה
וְאֵינֶם מְקוּרִים וְאֵין לָהֶם חֻמָּה וְאֵפִילוֹ יֵשׁ לָהֶם חֻמָּה אִם
הֵם מְפֻלָּשִׁים מִשְׁעַר לִשְׁעָר (וְאֵין דְּלִתוֹתָיו נְעוּלוֹת בְּלִילָה)
הוּא רְשׁוֹת הָרַבִּים."

37. So, since he speaks about *rechovos* [streets], okay, he mentioned the word "*Rechovos*". So therefore, they say, "*Yaish Omrim Sh'en Shishim Ribo Ovrin Bo*" ["there are those who say, unless there are 600,000 people who frequent it"], the word "*Bo*" ["in it"] means the "*Rechov*" ["street"], because the word "*Bo*" reffers to the "street" mentioned earlier, okay? Since he says, "*Rechovos Ushvokim*" ["streets and marketplaces"], therefore the word "*Bo*", reffers to "*Rechovos Ushvokim*". Although, you have to be a little simple in... in *dikduk* [grammar] to say like that, because the words "*Rechovos Ushvokim*" is plural, so it should say, "*Buham*" ["in them"], okay? Just if anybody... I mean, it would be a real simple.. but this is what they say.

38. Therefore, they say like this, that in order to have a *reshus harabim Deoraisah*, you have to have a single street, and; it has to be *Mefulosh Meshaar Leshaar* [open from gate to gate], that particular street, and; it should go from one end of the city to the other, and; in that street, you have to have 600,000 people walking around every single day. If any of these characteristics are missing you don't have a *reshus harabim*. Okay? You have to have a single street, a *rechov*, that has 600,000 people walking every single day in that street. And since, in Brooklyn you don't have that, they say, well,

everybody starts talking, "Ocean Parkway?, well, Ocean Parkway is not *Mefulosh Meshaar Leshaar*", and even if it is, they have a *cheshbon* [calculated reasoning], they asked the Mayor, they asked the... the... the... the chief of police, and so on and so forth. They all say different conversations that go on.

39. I... I marvel *rabosei*, at the insanity and the stupidity of... of otherwise intelligent people, who... who... who talk these things. And an other *zach* [thing]: Lets ask ourselves a question. If we'll say, that there is a condition, that a *reshus harabim Deoraisah* has to have 600,000 people walking in a single street every single day, is one thing... is one thing, that is absolutely certain beyond any *sofok* [doubt], and this is the... that according to this condition, there never was a *reshus harabim* since the world began, there never will be, and there can not be. There is no way in the world to have a single street with 600,000 people walking in the street every day. Even Broadway in Manhattan doesn't have *Shishim Ribo* walking in the street every single day. You'd have to have all the *machirs* [people in power] for... take a city of 25 million people, and they would make a special street, and actually be *mecheiyuv* [obligate] everybody to come down to the street. They only did those things in Soviet Russia. People don't choose the street just because they're trying to manufacture... There is no such thing.

40. So we have to ask ourselves a question. If the *tnei* [condition] in the *Mechaber* is such, that it's impossible to fulfill, so it's very nice to pat ourselves on the back and say, *ober sof kol sof* [but after all], that's the reason why the *poskim* say, that *bizman hazeh* [in nowadays] there is no *reshus harabim Deoraisah*, because we don't have such street. *Ei* [but isn't so, that] in the *Gemara*, it says that... all over, the *Gemara* mentions a *reshus harabim Deoraisah*, in Yerushalaim, in Naharda'ah, in Pumbedisa and every place under the sun had a *reshus harabim Deoraisah*, and it's all mentioned in *Shas*. So we'll have to say, that in Naharda'ah and in Pumbedisa and Yerushalaim there were streets... right... We have the old walls of Yerushalaim, *rabosei*. There is no way in the world that you could construct a street there, that could have 600,000 people walking there every day. And the *Gemara* says, "*Yerushalaim Ilmulei Delusosehu Ne'ulos Baleloh Chayuvin Buh Meshum Reshus Harabim*" ["Jerusalem, were it not that its gates were closed at night, it would have been subject to the restrictions of a public domain"].

41. Further... further more, the *reshus harabim*s [public domains] were common all over the place. They were found all over the place. How... how do I know? Because the most *gezeros* [restrictive decrees] in *Shas* are *Goder Atu Hotzaa B'reshus harabim*, *Shema Yavirenu Daled Amos* [preventive measures, because of the possibility that one may carry four *amos* in a public domain]. That's why they *aserd lulav*, that's why they *aserd Suka*, right?, *Veheinu Tama D'shofar* [and that is the reason why they forbade to blow the *Shofar* when *Rosh Hashanah* falls on *Shabbos*]. That's why they *aserd Eruv Chatzeros*, *Gzera Atu Hotzoa*, you understand? The half of *Mesechta Eruvin* is built on that. That's why they *aserd muktza*, according to the *pashtus haloshon* [explicit language] in the *Gemara*, in the *Ravad*, in *rov* [most] *Rishonim*. The *Rambam* says, there are other reasons, *inyonim* [reasons] why they *aserd muktza*. It's all a *Gzera Meshum Hotzoa* [restrictive decree because of the violation of taking out], okay?

42. So if you can set up a condition whereby

there is no such thing as a *reshus harabim Deoraisah*, it's physically impossible, then there is one thing that is *klur* [clear], you must be making a mistake in the condition, because the *Mechaber* never meant like that at all. The *Mechaber* meant, "*Yesh Omrim Shekol Sh'en Shishim Ribo Ovrin Bo*" ["there are those who say, unless there are 600,000 people who frequent it"], in the "*reshus*", you understand?, in the "place", in the "*mukor*" [source], and the "*mukor*" means the "city". It means the entire city.

43. Now *rabosei*, there were no cities in the time of the *Rama* [commentator on the *Mechaber* mentioned above] that had *Shishim Ribo*. Nor, were there cities in the times of the *Reshonim*, that had *Shishim Ribo*. They were small cities. In Europe, in... in... in Baghdad there were. There were eight, 900,000 people in Baghdad. In... in other places, in the East, there were such cities, but not in Europe. And that is why the *Rama* says, that "*bizmaneinu*" ["in nowadays"] and "*bimdinuseinu*" ["in our countries"], there is no *reshus harabim*, but not that he meant to say, that there has to be a single street with 600,000 people walking. Now... Yeah?

44. Question: [Question unintelligible].

Rosh Yeshiva: It's all one... it's all one... it's all one big street. It's all... As long it's *mefulosh*, as long it's not a dead end street, you go in and you go out, you... you don't... it's not a dead end street. A street shaped like a *Ches* [the Hebrew letter ח] is not *mefulosh*. There is no other case, it's not *mefulosh*.

45. Question: Every time you carry... you carry in a small street you're *over* [violating] an *issur*...?

Rosh Yeshiva: Yeah! Anybody who carries in Borough Park with the *eruv* is *over* an *Issur Deoraisah* [Torah violaton]. Anybody who did it, is *Mechalel Shabbos Befarhesya* [desecrating the Shabbos in public]. His wine is *Yine Nesech* [wine from which a libation to a heathen god was made], and so on and so forth. I want to tell you *rabosei*, that... and... the... there is no, you know...

46. Question: Anywhere in Brooklyn?

Rosh Yeshiva: Anywhere in Brooklyn, except the dead end streets. In Canarsie, there's a *mukor* [possibility], because Canarsie is surrounded by three sides. It's not *mefulosh*. There's a *makom* [possibility] to be *meikel* [lenient]. Perhaps the *Paerdegats*, and these places where there's deep cut inlets, that has like sort of walls on both sides.

47. Question: [Question unintelligible].

Rosh Yeshiva: You have to make it, to make an *eruv*. What... what good is it? You can't make an *eruv* with strings and sticks. You could use, call it phone lines. You could have... It doesn't make a difference. A *Tzuras Hapesach* is no good in a *reshus harabim Deoraisah*, period! You need *delusos* [doors].

48. Question: [Question unintelligible].

Rosh Yeshiva: The sidewalks are the same thing. The sidewalks are all part of the *reshus harabim*.

49. Question: So what's in Bnei Brak? How does Bnei Brak have an *eruv*?

Rosh Yeshiva: Bnei Brak is a small town. Bnei Brak doesn't have... they have... it doesn't have more than 50,000 people.

50. Question: Yerushalaim?

Rosh Yeshiva: In Yerushalaim...

51. Question: Borough Park doesn't have either...?

Rosh Yeshiva: What?

Question repeated: Borough Park doesn't

have more than... it doesn't even have...

Rosh Yeshiva: Borough Park is one continuous city. There's no *hefsek* [separation], it doesn't stop. You call it "Neighborhood Borough Park", you call this neighborhood "Kensington". Is it a neighborhood? Where does it stop and where does it start? If you stretch out your head to far you're in a different neighborhood.

52. Question: [Queens... (unintelligible)]

Rosh Yeshiva: Just a minute. Queens has a different... Queens was a separate *Sheila* [question], *rabosei*. I could be *masbir* [explaining]...

53. Question: Why is an alley...?

Rosh Yeshiva: An alley is not a *reshus harabim*. It is not where the *rabim* go. An alley is not a *reshus harabim*.

54. Question: Yerushalaim has *Shishim Ribo*...?

Rosh Yeshiva: Yerushalaim... At the last census, Yerushalaim was close to 600,000. But Yerushalaim *rabosei* - first off all - is totally cut off. If anybody knows, there's a *pargud* [wall] in Yerushalaim. The south western sections of Yerushalaim are half a mile separated from the rest of the city. Ir Ganim and Kiryat Yovel, all those places, they're... they're... they're separate. Even... even Bayit V'gan is totally separate. There're... there're... there're big *hefseikos* [separations].

55. Question: Ramot...?

Rosh Yeshiva: What?

Question repeated: Ramot...?

Rosh Yeshiva: Ramot is separate, Neve Yaakov is separate. Those are places, sections that are like an individual town. All these together... all these together are barely equal to *Shishim Ribo* [600,000]. It's not in Brooklyn, which is one single city, where there are three million people living together, five times *Shishim Ribo*, and three million people, with excluding another million or two from the illegal aliens who are here, which means... which... it's all one continu...

56. ... *Mein... mein teir kinderlich*, I... I... I want to tell you something. I... I am *mochel* [inclined to forgive] a... a person who didn't learn through the *Sugyos* [topics], the basic *Sugyos*, if he says that McDonald Avenue cuts off half of Brooklyn. Why? Because there's a *kira* [ceiling], because there's a ceiling over the tra[ck], over the... And anybody who learned through the basic *Sugyos* of *Shabbos*, which by the way, they learn in High School here, should know, that there's no such thing.

57. The *Gemara* says that, "*Hoagolos*" ["the tabernacle wagons"], what does it say? "*Tachteihem Ubeneihem Reshus Harabim*" ["beneath them and between them has status of a public domain"]. No? "*Ubeneihem, Reshus Harabim*" ["and between them has status of a public domain"], so the *Gemara* says; "but what if they're all covered?" So the *Gemara* says; "that can't be, because, *Ein Reshus Harabim Mekura*" ["a roofed area is not defined as a public domain"], so that only "*Beneihem*" ["the areas between them"] is *reshus harabim*. So between two places that are covered there's a *reshus harabim*. The fact, that there's a place that's *mekura* [roofed], and on one side of it... another side of it... it's all one. It's one city. It's not *shayich* [possible] to say, because it's *mekura*, it's a *reshu[s]*... it... it separates the city into two cities.

58. Question: On McDonald itself...?

Rosh Yeshiva: Under the track... So it's a *reshus harabim mekura* [roofed public domain]. Under the track it's possible to make a *Tzuras Hapesach*, yes, while you're under the track. In other

words, those who want to stay under the track, not go up to the sidewalk, because you carry from one part of the track onto the other... under the track...

59. **Question:** [About making roofs over Flatbush. (wording unintelligible)]

Rosh Yeshiva: What?

60. **Question:** [Repeating above].

Rosh Yeshiva: Well, planetary roofs? That's like the Satmar Rov said, "*heint, vos in der heim iz ge'ven a Roov iz a Shlock iz in America a Roov*". "*Shlocka... Shlocka Roov*" [vicious... vicious rabbi], they say. *Se farhan a vort* [there is a saying], in... in the *Suka*... in *Suka* the covering was always called a "*Shlock*". In English they say it's a "roof", right? But he meant something else, "*in der heim iz geven a Shlock iz do a Roov*" [back in the old country one who was considered vicious is in America considered a Rabbi].

61. **Question:** If someone makes an *eruv*... two or three houses with a string... it's a mistake to make a...?

Rosh Yeshiva: No, it's a mistake. *Rabosei*, I... I want... I want... I want to tell you something. There are people who... I... I just want to tell you something. The fact... the fact that there are people who are not *klur* [clear] in the *halachos*, and they go ahead and do what they want, is nothing new. That happens all the times. The fact that these people are fighting everyone else to make an *eruv*, it's not because they're not *klur*, and the fact that they're misquoting all these names and they're lying through their teeth, that's not because they're not *klur*. They are malicious evil people! It's not they're not *klur*. They know, that it's not so! They were told by the closest people to all these *Rabbonim* who were there, that it's not so. They do it... on their... They do it, notwithstanding, and... and I... and I... I want to te[ll]...

62. **Question:** What's in for them?

Rosh Yeshiva: What's in for them? *Mein tiera*, I... I want to explain to you just one more thing. All these 25 names or the others who were there by the meeting, who had voted unanimously not to have it, all those... the... the older *Rabbonim* and...

63. Let me... Lets ask ourselves a question. If we're talking about the *kehila* here in New York, to say, that Reb Aron and Reb Moshe and the Satmar Rov... Take out these three, okay? Who do you have left? These were the leaders, the *roshei hayehadus bemdinuseinu* [Jewish leaders of our countries]. That means, if they said, it's *oser Medeoraisah*, there's nothing left after that. So, besides all that, besides all the *Rabbonim*, take the two or three, three or four bona fide people who put up this monkey business over here, and we'll be *mefaret* [listing] a *chelek* of the names.

64. I want to tell you something, and... and with that, I am not going to mention anything anymore. You are young people, and there are things which are hard to... to learn. *Yetzt rabosei* [now gentlemen], there are certain people who are successful, they made it in the world. They have followers. Either they're *Rebbes* with *Chasidim*, or they're *Roshei Yeshivos* with *Talmidim*, or they're *Rabbonim* with *Baalei Batim*. They're people who are respected. They're people who succeeded. There are people who are failures. They tried, they closed down. They tried again, and they closed down again. All these people are from that group. One of them, had a *Yeshiva* twice, it closed, bankrupted each time, no *Talmidim*, no *Rabayim*, no *Mispalalim* in the *Shul*. Another one, has *Mispalalim* in the *Shul*, but opened a *Mosad* [school] three, four times, and it always

closed and went left with nothing. The other one, has *veiter* [further]... [unintelligible] *Shul* and no *Mispalalim*.

65. People who are failures in life often try to do something. "*Na'aseh Lanu Sheim Pen Nafutz Al... Havu Nivneh Lanu Ir Umigdol Verosho Bashumiem Vena'aseh Lanu Sheim*" ["Let us make us a name, lest we be scattered abroad upon... Come, let us build us a city and a tower, with its top in heaven, and let us make us a name"].

66. It is an attempt, that's making a name for themselves by doing something. Finally, finally they'll make the grade. *Rabosei*, they were failures their whole lives, they will always be failures. And, there is a reason why they are failures. There is a reason why the *Talmidim* run away from them, why the *Baalei Batim* run away from them. There is reason for it.

67. And this, you see, anybody who doesn't have the slightest *Pachad* [fear], that he tries to be *matir* the most *chomor'dega issur* [serious violation] in *Kol Hatorah Kula*, which is, the *issur* of *Hotzoa* [taking out] on *Shabbos*. The *issur* of *Hotzoa* on *Shabbos* is the most *chomor'dega issur* in *Kol Hatorah Kula*. It's more *chomor* [serious] than *Nida* because *Nida* is only *mechuyiv kores* [punished by premature death] and *Hotzoa* in *Shabbos* is *mechuyiv Misas Bes Din* [punished by death through beth din] and *Skila* [execution by stoning]. It's more *chomor* than *Retzicha* [murder]. *Retzicha* is only *mechuyiv Hereg* [punished by execution with a sword] and this is *mechuyiv Skila* [punished through execution by stoning].

68. All right, like I mentioned the other time, there's... there's 200 and more *blatt Gemara* about the *issur* of *Hotzoa* on *Shabbos*. The entire *Mesechta Eruvin*, a third of *Mesechta Shabbos*, all over, *Pesochim*, in *Beia*, in *Suka*, in *Rosh Hashanah* in *Megila*, where ever you go, it talks about the *issur Hotzoa* [violation of taking out] on *Shabbos*. *Hilel Hazoken* became the *Nasi* [chief of the *Sanhedrin*] because he solved the problem of *Hotzoa* on *Shabbos*, bringing the... the... the... eh... the *sakinim* [knives] *mit* [with]... the whole... the whole story in *Pesochim*. The *issur* of *Hotzoa* on *Shabbos* is from the *yesod hayesodes* [foundation of the foundations]. *Mesechta Shabbos* starts out with it. It's the most precious and most *chomor'diga issur* that there is.

69. Anybody who intends to violate and to dissolve that *Issur Hotzoa* and to say, the *Baal Shem Tov* made *eruv* in small *shtetlech* [villages], in... where the *Baal Shem Tov* was, in little villages, therefore you're allowed to do it. It's a *mitzvah* to make one where it's *mutir*, therefore it's a *mitzvah* to make one where it's *oser*. You have to be... you have to be not an *Am Ha'orets* [ignorant], *rabosei*. People who say that, are willful malicious malevolent people, to say, the *Baal Shem Tov* said, it's a *mitzvah*.

70. They'll say, that in *Shas* it says, it's a *mitzvah* to make an *eruv*, okay, I grant them their *am haratzis* [ignorance], that in *Shas* it doesn't say any such thing. In *Shas* it says, it's a *mitzvah* to make an *Eruv Chatzeros*, it never says there's a *mitzvah* to make a *Tzuras Hapesach* any where in *Shas*. There is not one *Gemara* like that. There is no *mitzvah* to make *Mechitzos* [partitions]. There is a *mitzvah* to make *Eruvin*. *Eruvin* is, where there's an *Eruv Chatzeros* or *Shituf Mevuos* [an *eruv* made by token partnership of the inmates of the same alley]. That's all it ever says in *Shas*. The fact that they say it, because there were always *Rabbonim* in Europe who said it's a *mitzvah*. It's a *mitzvah*, the *Baal Shem Tov* made *taka* [actually] *Tzuras Hapesach* in the small villages,

because in the small village, *avada* you're allowed. That's all the *Baal Shem Tov* really was... What?

71. **Question:** [About making a *Tzuras Hapesach* (unintelligible)].

Rosh Yeshiva: *Mishna Berurah*... *Tzuras Hapesach*, because the *Mishna Berurah* said? The *Mishna Berurah* says, that you gotta be... it's *kedei* [worthwhile] for a *Baal Nefesh* [for a G-d fearing person] to be *choshesh* [cautious].

SIDE 2 OF TAPE

72. ... or if it's a *seratya upelatya gedola* [highway and a big marketplace], so you can't make a *Tzuras Hapesach*. That's... that's *loit* [according] the *Shita* [principle] of the *Rambam*. But in Europe, they weren't *noheg* [commonly practicing] like the *Rambam*, but *lechol hapochos* [at least], there were many *Rabbonim* who *aserd*, many *Rabbonim* who were *matir*. The *Beis Ephraim* and the *Mishkenos Yaakov* [two halachic authorities] had big *Tshuvos* going back and forth. So these villains say, that they hold like the *Beis Ephraim*. The *Beis Ephraim* said, that you could be *somech* [relying] on the *Reshonim* who say, that you need *Shishim Ribo*, but not, that you need *Shishim Ribo* in a single street every single day, which no one said and no one could possibly say.

73. You see? So... and... and... and I... I want to ask you *rabosei*, just the simplest of all questions. And it's about the... If... if there was any of the *Taryag Mitzvos*, any *Mitzvah Derabonon* [rabbinical enactment], any *halacha* in *Hilchos Brochos*, in *Hilchos* anything, any *dovor kal* [simple matter], any *dovor chomor* [serious matter], which you heard that the *Gedolei Hador aserd*, and you heard that some *Rov* from some village in Eastern Europe, which... whether it ever had a Jewish population or not, but today for sure, for the last sixty years it doesn't have, and this particular *Rov*, he holds it's *mutir*, I would like to ask you a question: would any of you, have the slightest doubt, - not in a *Deoraisah* [Torah enactment] - in a *Derabonon* [rabbinical enactment], in a *Minhag* [common custom], would anyone have the slightest doubt, whether they should do it or not do it? There wouldn't be a *sofok*! That *davka* in the *mitzvah* of *Hotzoa*, which is the most *chomor'dega issur* in *Kol Hatorah Kula*...

74. And why I say it's the most *chomor'dega issur*? I told you two reasons. One, because there's more *gezeros*, and more *sugyos*, and more words in *Shas*, then there is in the next ten *sugyos* combined or the next twenty.

75. Secondly, because it's *Mechuyiv Skila* [punished through execution by stoning] and *Issur Chomor od me'od* [is an extremely serious violation].

76. And third, I... I mentioned there on the phone, I... Should I repeat it? I told you, that there is no *klurara* [clearer] place in *Tnach*, other than the section that says, that the *Beis Hamikdosh* was *chorov*, because they were *mezalzel* [despising] in the *Issur Hotzoa* on *Shabbos*. And when they rebuilt the second *Beis Hamikdosh*, and people started carrying on the street on *Shabbos*, so *Nechemya* [name of a prophet] told them, "*Ko Osu Avoseichem*" ["this is what your ancestors did"], and they carried in the street on *Shabbos*. They... they were *mezalzel* like I... I read that piece of *Tnach*, I think, here or in the phone, where it says, that... it says, that if... if they would have stopped carrying on *Shabbos*, - *rabosei*, - and not violate the *Issur Hotzoa*, so the *Beis Hamikdosh* wouldn't have become *chorov leolam*

voad, despite all the *aveiros*. And if they were going to be *over* on *Hotzoa*, no matter what *tshuva* they did, the *Beis Hamikdosh* would become *chorov*. That's... that's how *chomor* the *Issur Hotzoa* is.

77. So *kal vechomer ben bno shel kal vechomer* [it being so clearly logical], that all these small nameless failures, who have no standing... Did anybody ever quote you an *halacha - rabosei* - that you decided to do, because the *Linzer Rov* said, or because *Katz* said, or because *Klein* said? There isn't a single person who... who... who said, "I do it because one of these three said it".

78. You never heard of them until now, except about stories of this or that, but they don't play any role in anything. All of a sudden they become a voice, and they have to *rechen zich* [be considered]. Where?, in an *issur*, where everyone of the *Gedolei Hador*, where all the *Rabbonim* in the section of the city, every single person *aserd*, where *Reb Moshe zt"l* held, you're *Mechuyiv Misas Bes Din* [subject to death by beth din] if you do it. Where an *issur... issur chomor od me'od* [extremely serious violation]... All of a sudden, they should start giving equal time to the... the tiniest of the tiny, that you have to use a... a microscope to locate them, *klapei... klapei* [comparing to] the others who are...

79. I... I don't think it's even fair for me to say, they're... that *Moshe* was bigger than this one. It doesn't make a difference, I think every *cheder yingel* [schoolchild] is as great and bigger than them. There is no... I don't know anybody who would... who would go and make these stupid mistakes and the *am haratzis* [ignorance] that... that they make. And to... and to misquote and to... I... I don't know anyone. What *rechenmung* [status], what... what standing do they have in our society? How could we be *mezalzel*? How could we... I... I can't be *masig* [perceiving] it. I... I just... To me it's so anathema, it's so unbelievable. I can't, uhm... I can't understand.

80. If someone says, there's a *sheila* on a certain potato chip, so right away, the whole... there would be a whole alarm, "what could the *sheila* be?" The *sheila* could be that there's a *taaruvos* [mixture with a non-kosher product] that *b'emes* [really] is *botol* [neutralized], except, because, *Chaticha Nasa Neveila B'lach* [a topic relevant to kosher dietary law], maybe this and that, there's a *mokum* [point] to be *machmir*, but all of a sudden, *Kol Koras* [proclamations] will go out, everybody will *aser*.

81. So what? So why not go out and get pork rind, and eat it? It's only an *issur lav* [a lesser punishable Torah violation, known as a "lav"], that's all! Eating pork, *temeia* [impure] is only a *lav*, or *lav v'esa* [a violation of a "lav" combined with a violation derived from an "esa"], "*Kol Beheima Tehora Tocheilu*" [(as stated:) "of all clean beasts you may eat"].

82. So, if a person is willing to take a chance on... on an *Issur Skila* [violation punishable through execution by stoning], on the *chamura shebechamuros* [most serious violation], so then he'll be *over* [violating] *lavin* [plural for lav] too. It tastes very good. The *goyim* told me that pork rind tastes very good. Why not? It's at least as enjoyable, as walking out in the street with some... some idiotic *masa* [object] a person has to carry.

83. **Question:** Why don't the *Roshei Yeshivos* and the *Rabbonim* get together -

Rosh Yeshiva: They did.

Continuing Question: - and...

Rosh Yeshiva: Because...

Continuing Question: - and put them in *Cherem* [excommunication], and that would be the

end?

Someone else interfering: Why don't they publish their names?

Continuing Question: - put them in *Cherem*, and that would be the...

Rosh Yeshiva: they have all the names.

Continuing Question: - They have the names of the people that go against it.

Rosh Yeshiva: That will be the next thing *rabosei*! But I...

84. **Someone saying:** - But there are still people who will go against it.

Rosh Yeshiva: I have... I have... I have... You have to realize; in our society, when you attack a person he becomes the *nirdaf* [martyr], and then everybody stands up, and they say, "*Chas Vesholom* to be *pogeia* [degrading] in his *kovod*, and *Chas Vesholom*...", and they... they... they all stand up, and they're all *meshabeiach* [praising], and they could follow it and follow it. Don't make the mistake of turning a person into a martyr. Don't make a mistake of turning a person into a *nirdaf*. That's exactly what they are looking for!

85. **Why do you think they come barging in?** The two arch villains of the... one of them barged into the meeting twenty years ago, and one of them barged in the last week's meeting, and the same thing, put on a public show, and laughed and made fun, and... and insulted everybody. Why do you think they're doing it?

86. **Rabosei**, when some *Meshugana* throws a rock into a store window, and he gets his picture in the paper, right?, and they take him away in handcuffs, that's exactly what he's looking for. Publicity! He is looking to have his name published. He is looking to become a *Mefursam* [famous man]. The most important thing to know is, you don't mention a name, right? You remember that famous person who said, "I don't care what the papers say about me, as long as they spell my name right."

87. **Question:** Why In Flatbush did the *Rabbonim* make an *eruv*?

Rosh Yeshiva: In Flatbush, the Young Israel made the *eruv*; Why? Because the Flatbush Rabbis *zolin mir mochel zein*, *Kvodom Bemkomom Munach* [may they forgive me, their fame is properly placed]... *Bizyonom Bemkomom Munach* [their disgrace is properly placed], the Vaad Horabonim of Flatbush went, and I would stand on its committee twenty, twenty five years ago, and I visited... visited many of the Vaad Horabonim of Flatbush, and the answer was one answer, the answer was; there's a certain rabbi in Borough Park who told them, "go ahead with it", and *heyos* [since] that he didn't shave for a long, long time, and he... he looks very religious, and because of that he wrote a whole *kunteres* [booklet], and this was his *kunteres* that he wrote.

88. The... the Vaad Horabonim went to Reb Moshe with this *kunteres*, and the next day they published... they published... eh... an ad in the *Morgan Journal*, and the ad was, that *Hagoan Hador Reb Moshe Shlita Rabon Shel Kol Bnei Hagola* [the leader of the entire generation Rabbi Moshe], officially told the... the *Rabbonim* of Flatbush that they have the right *altz poskim* [as halachic authorities] and *altz Rabbonim* [as rabbis] to decide for themselves, and based on that, they're publishing their *Psak* that there should be an *eruv* in Flatbush.

89. I was sitting in the car a day or two later with Reb Michael Birenbaum, *zol gezunt in shtark zein*. You know, Reb Michael is a... was close to Reb Moshe, he is a *Mashgiach*. Reb Michael said, he was

there in the house. He said, the *Rabbonim* came there, a delegation of five, six *Rabbonim*, and they brought the *kunteres* of that fellow in Borough Park with the red light, and he said, that the red lights have a *din* [precept] like a *choma* [wall], because *Dina Demalchusa Dina* [the law of the land is binding], and when the city tells you to stop by the red light, it's like there would be a wall, and *memeila* [therefore], it has a *din* like a... like a... like a... like a *choma*, *ir sheyesh lo choma* [a walled city], on every street there's a *choma*. And he said furthermore, in the middle of the street there's a *sekana* [danger] to walk, because, *vegen* [because of] the cars, so that can't be called a *reshus harabim*, because of *skunas nefoshos* [life danger], and the side street is called *Tzidei Reshus Harabim* [borders of a public domain], so therefore... and it's... so people walk there, and *memeila* it's also not *reshus harabim*, cause *Tzidei Reshus Harabim Lav Kereshus Harabim Domi* [borders of a public domain are not considered as public domains], so therefore there's no *reshus harabim*, and so on. This was... this was the... the gist of all these things. And in that *kunteres*, it said about *Shlomo Hamelech* building an *eruv* in Brooklyn... in... in Yerushalaim, and also it said about... about eh...

90. Reb Moshe knew, Reb Mo[sh]e... They gave the *Teshuva*, and they asked Reb Moshe, he... he should... he should look at the *Teshuva*. Reb Moshe stood like this, Reb Michael said, with his hands at the side and his face down, and he didn't say a word. And they... and *veiter* [further] they... they pushed it in, "*Rosh Yeshiva, Rosh Yeshiva*, take a look at the *Teshuva*". So they... they thrust it into his hand, and Reb Moshe just let it drop to the floor, it was laying on the floor. And one of them called out, "*Rosh Yeshiva, farvos vilt ir nisht kulin in Teshuva?*" ["*Rosh Yeshiva*, why don't you want to look in the responsum?"]. So this time Reb Moshe turned around, he walked out and he slammed the door, and on the way out he said: "*Vos kumt ir tzu mir?, Ir zent doch alein Rabbonim, paskent far zich*" ["Why are you coming to me?, You're actually yourselves rabbis, rule for yourself"], and he slammed the door. That was it.

91. So on that basis, they put an ad in the paper the next day, that the Gaon Hador Reb Moshe Feinstein was *modia* [notifying] to the *tzibur*, that the Vaad Horabonim of Flatbush are *poskim* and they could *pasken*!

92. Eh... I... I can't be... I can't be *masig* [perceiving] it *rabosei*. I don't know, I... I hear all day... I am in very many different businesses; the *Kashrus* business, and the *Sheila* business, and... and everybody comes or calls me up a whole day long. Everybody is *pachad* [fearful]. A 1000 people, at least 200 people during every week, and... and... and all the people have one... one thing, if there's a *sheila*, they want to know, if it's a *sofok*, are you really allowed? Is it *mutir*? Is it a hundred percent? *Ein Hachi Nami* [true], this one says *mutir* but maybe it's *taka oser*? Everybody is... everybody is, is all *zohir* [careful] in all *Taryag Mitzvos*, except one, and that one, the most *chomor* of all. I can't be *masig* it.

93. And these... To me, the most... the most painful thing is that these... that... that, these... these people tried, I mean, it's a malicious thing! They tried to give it the... they color it with these words *Chasidish*! That *Chasidish* is... is an *inun* [matter] to make *eruv*. The fact that every Rebbe over here is... is... signed against it, that doesn't mean anything, but they'll say; "This *eruv* is *Chasidish*!" You understand? They try to cover it. That... that's

what they try to... to sell to the *tzibur*. I mean, how... how malicious could a person be?

94. **Question:** Did anyone ever try speaking to these *Rabbonim* and -

Rosh Yeshiva: Absolutely!

Question continued: - taking out *Seforim* -

Rosh Yeshiva: Absolutely!

Question continued: and proving them?

Rosh Yeshiva: Absolutely!

Question continued: And?

Rosh Yeshiva: I know the people who went over, and I know the people who spoke with them. There is nothing to whom to talk. There is nothing what to talk.

95. **Question:** Are they learning wrong *pshat*?

Rosh Yeshiva: They're not... they're not learning *pshat*... right *psaht*, wrong *psaht*. They... The *verter klepen zich nisht einer tzum tzveitin* [the words don't stick one to each other]. There... there is a reason why these people are failures. There is a reason why no *Baalei Batim*, no *Chasidim*, no *Talmidim klept zach* [stick]. There is a reason for it. Why is it so? Did anybody... anybody... anybody think into that? Give me the... the *Yirmiyahu* [name of a book of *Prophets*]. Just... You understand?

96. **Question:** There's one specific rabbi of the Young Israel who is very respected, and he holds that...

Rosh Yeshiva: Who, Kenny Auman?

Responding: Yes.

Rosh Yeshiva: I want to tell you, Kenny Auman told me, when Kenny Auman took the job, so they gave it to him with a *tnei kofol* [double condition], that he'll never say a word against the *eruv*. So he said, fine! but, he will never say a word for the *eruv* either! He told me personally, he says, "Klein is a fraud, the whole *Teshuva* is fraudulent, the whole *Heter* is fraudulent".

97. **Someone saying:** He doesn't hold of it.

Rosh Yeshiva: He doesn't hold of it. All right, I am telling you what he told me. He's a *feiner yungerman* [fine young man], and he told this to me when he took the job. He took the job *betnei* [on the condition]... He took the job with a *tnei kofol*, and every... that... that if they... if they... if they... if he... if he says a word against the *eruv*, he... they'll boot him out *boi bayom* [in the same day]. That was the job, and... and he told me, that it's a fraud, and the one who made it is a fraud.

98. **Question:** Why did he accept the Job?

Rosh Yeshiva: He has an *achreyos* [responsibility], -

99. **Question:** [Unintelligible].

Rosh Yeshiva: I don't know. He has an *achreyos*, and he... he... he could accomplish a tremendous amount with this *Shul*. He's a very big *yirei shomeyim*.

100. **Question:** But how does he let it?

Rosh Yeshiva: He tells people privately, and most... and most of the people *taka* don't carry like they used to.

101. *Rabosei*, if you know anyone who's a good friend of yours... It's... it's... it's almost the end of the *shiur*, so I... I... there is no purpose of starting... starting the *Gemara*. But let... let me... let me read... you'll... you'll have a little of the... of the flavor. *Rabosei... rabosei*, here in... in... in *Kapital Yud Zein*, *Posuk Yud Tes* [chapter 17, verse 19], in *Yirmiyah*, seventeen, nineteen, it says like this. I'll just... just read it to you, and then you'll look at it yourself if you want.

"כה אמר ד' אלי הלוך ועמדת בשער בני העם אשר יבאו בו מלכי יהודה וכל יהודה ואשר יצאו בו ובכל שערי ירושלם: ואמרת אליהם שמעו דבר ד' מלכי יהודה וכל יהודה וכל יושבי ירושלם הבאים בשערים האלה: כה אמר ד' השמרו בנפשותיכם ואל תשא משא ביום השבת והבאתם בשערי ירושלם: ולא תוציאו משא מבתיכם ביום השבת וכל מלאכה לא תעשו וקדשתם את יום השבת כאשר צויתי את אבותיכם: ולא שמעו ולא הטו את אזנם ויקשו את ערפם לבלתי שמוע ולבלתי קחת מוסר: והי' אם שמוע תשמעון אלי נאם ד' לבלתי הביא משא בשערי העיר הזאת ביום השבת ולקדש את יום השבת ובאו בשערי העיר הזאת מלכים ושרים ישבים על כסא דוד רכבים ברכב ובסוסים המה ושריהם איש יהודה וישבי ירושלם וישבה העיר הזאת לעולם: ובאו מערי יהודה ומסביבות ירושלם ומארץ בנימין ומן השפלה ומן ההר ומן הנגב מבאים עלה וזבח ומנחה ולבונה ומבאי תודה בית ד': ואם לא תשמעו אלי לקדש את יום השבת ולבלתי שאת משא ובא בשערי ירושלם ביום השבת והצתי אש בשערי' ואכלה ארמנות ירושלם ולא תכבה:"

102. And these people *rabosei*, are *Reshoim Gemurim* [completely wicked], they are *machrivim Klal Yisroel* [destroying the Jewish nation]. If... if there's... if there's... if there's anyone who is prolonging the *Galus* [exile], it's them! It's people like this, who absolutely in the old days they would have set up the *Baal* and the *Asheira* [names of idols], and this is their... their... their act today. It's just a simple matter of, "*Hovu Nivneh Lanu Ir Venasa Lanu Sheim*" ["come, let us build us a city, and let us make us a name"], that is all it is, nothing! And there is no basis, there is nothing, and... and anybody who listens... How... I can't be *masig* [perceiving] how a person can have a *sofok* in his mind, at all the *Gedolei Hador* on one side, and a few of these on the other side. To me it's... it's just beyond belief.

END